



European Communities

EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

WORKING DOCUMENTS

English Edition

1985-86

31 May 1985

SERIES A

DOCUMENT A2-53/85

REPORT

drawn up on behalf of the Committee on the Environment,
Public Health and Consumer Protection

on the proposal from the Commission of the European
Communities to the Council for a directive on the
approximation of the laws of the Member States relating
to quick-frozen foodstuffs for human consumption
(COM(84) 489 final - Doc. 2-777/84)

Rapporteur: Mrs U. SCHLEICHER

WG(2)1817E

PE 97.251/fin.



By letter of 15 October 1984, the President of the Council of the European Communities requested the European Parliament to deliver an opinion pursuant to Article 235 of the EEC Treaty on the proposal from the Commission of the European Communities to the Council for a Directive on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to quick-frozen foodstuffs for human consumption.

On 23 October 1984 the President of the European Parliament referred this proposal to the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection as the committee responsible and to the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food and the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy for opinions. The latter decided at its meeting of 21 November 1984 not to deliver an opinion.

At its meeting of 30 October 1984 the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection appointed Mrs SCHLEICHER rapporteur.

The committee considered the Commission's proposal at its meeting of 29 January 1985 and the draft report at its meetings of 24 April 1985 and 21 May 1985.

At the last meeting the committee decided unanimously to recommend to Parliament that it approve the Commission's proposal with the following amendments.

The committee then unanimously adopted the motion for a resolution as a whole.

The following took part in the vote: Mrs Weber, chairman; Mrs Schleicher, vice-chairman and rapporteur; Mrs Banotti, Mr Elliott (deputizing for Mr Tognoli), Mr Iversen, Mrs Jackson, Mrs Lentz-Cornette, Mr Mertens, Mr Pearce, Mrs Peus (deputizing for Mr Alber), Mr Roelants du Vivier, Mr Ryan (deputizing for Mr Parodi), Mr Schmid, Mr Schwalba-Hoth (deputizing for Mr van der Lek), Mr Sherlock, Mrs Squarcialupi, Ms Tongue and Mr Vittinghof.

The opinion of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food is attached.

The report was tabled on 28 May 1985.

The deadline for the tabling of amendments to this report appears in the draft agenda for the part-session at which it will be debated.

C O N T E N T S

	<u>Page</u>
Amendments to the Commission's proposal	5
A. MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION	12
B. EXPLANATORY STATEMENT	14
Opinion of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food	19

The Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection hereby submits to the European Parliament the following amendments to the Commission's proposal and motion for a resolution together with explanatory statement:

- I. Proposal from the Commission for a Council Directive on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to quick-frozen foodstuffs for human consumption

Text proposed by the Commission
of the European Communities

Amendments tabled by the Committee on
the Environment, Public Health and
Consumer Protection

Preamble, first to seventh recitals unchanged

Amendment No. 1

Preamble, eighth recital

Amend this recital to read as follows:

Whereas upward fluctuations are necessary on technical grounds and may therefore be tolerated provided they are in accordance with good commercial practice and do not jeopardize the quality of the products;

Whereas short-term upward fluctuations are necessary on technical grounds and may therefore be tolerated provided they are in accordance with good commercial practice and do not jeopardize the quality of the products; short-term fluctuations may occur in transport at the loading and unloading stages and during local distribution where intensive sales operations are involved. In controls on retail shops measurements shall be carried out not only during the day but also in the early morning.

Preamble, ninth and tenth recitals unchanged

Amendment No. 2

Preamble, eleventh recital

The eleventh recital to read as follows:

Whereas this Directive need merely state the objectives to be attained as regards both the equipment used for the quick-freezing process and the temperatures to be adhered to in the installations and appliances for storage, handling and distribution;

Whereas this Directive need merely state the objectives to be attained as regards both the equipment used for the quick-freezing process and the temperatures to be adhered to in the installations and appliances for storage, handling, transport and distribution;

Preamble, twelfth recital to Article 1(1) unchanged

Amendment No. 3

Article 1(2)

Article 1(2) to read as follows:

2. For the purposes of this Directive, 'quick-frozen foodstuffs' means foodstuffs put up for sale which have undergone a suitable freezing process known as 'quick-freezing' whereby the temperature zone of maximum crystallization is spanned as rapidly as necessary, depending on the type of product, with the result that the temperature at the centre of the product is -18°C or lower.

2. For the purposes of this Directive, 'quick-frozen foodstuffs' means foodstuffs put up for sale which have undergone a suitable freezing process known as 'quick-freezing' whereby the temperature zone of maximum crystallization is spanned as rapidly as necessary, depending on the type of product, with the result that after thermal stabilization the temperature of the product falls to -18°C or lower.

For the purposes of this Directive ice-cream and other edible ices shall not be regarded as quick-frozen foodstuffs

Unchanged

Amendment No. 4

Article 1(2)(a)(new)

Insert a new Article 1(2)(a) to read as follows:

The temperature of a product shall be defined as follows: the temperature measured 2.5 cm below the centre of the largest surface of the product. If the product is less than 5 cm thick at this point, the temperature shall be measured at the half-way point.

(This term shall replace the term 'temperature of the product' in all following paragraphs).

Article 1(3) to Article 3(1) unchanged

Amendment No. 5

Article 3(2)

Insert the following after the first
sentence:

The quick-freezing operation must be carried out with the aid of appropriate equipment.

It shall be carried out as rapidly as possible and in accordance with the usual production procedures.

It shall take place immediately after preparation of the product to be processed.

Article 4 unchanged

Amendment No. 6

Article 5(1)

Add the following to Article 5(1)

During storage and transport and in retail display cabinets, the temperature of quick-frozen foodstuffs shall, subject to the provisions of paragraphs 2 and 3, be maintained at -18°C or lower at the centre of the product.

Retail display cabinets (for storage at -18°C) must be equipped with thermographs to ensure that the temperature never rises above -18 C during storage. This graph must be visible to purchasers in the same way as the latest permitted selling date is visible on other products.

Amendment No. 7

Article 5(2)

Amend Article 5(2) to read as follows:

Upward fluctuations in accordance with good storage and distribution practices shall be permitted, on condition that they do not exceed:

Short-term upward fluctuations of the temperature of the product in accordance with good storage and distribution practices shall be permitted, on condition they do not exceed:

(a) unchanged

(a) unchanged

Amendment No. 8

Article 5(2)(b)

Amend Article 5(2)(b) to read as follows:

(b) 6°C during local distribution and in retail display cabinets

(b) 6°C in the warmest packet during local distribution and in retail display cabinets.

Amendment No. 9

Article 5(3)

Amendment Article 5(3) to read as follows:

Should the tolerances allowed in paragraph 2 be either accidentally unforeseeable exceeded, the product in question shall be examined to determine the use to which it may be put.

Should the tolerances allowed in paragraph 2 be either accidentally or unforeseeably exceeded, the product in question shall be examined to determine the use to which it may be put. A clear warning must be affixed to products which have fully or partially thawed.

Amendment No. 10

Article 6(1)(a)

Amendment Article 6(1)(a) to read as follows:

Text proposed by the Commission
of the European Communities

(a) the equipment used for quick-freezing;

Amendments tabled by the Committee on
the Environment, Public Health and
Consumer Protection

(a) the equipment used for quick-freezing, clearly visible
thermometers and compliance with the
maximum load line;

Article 6(1)(b) and Article 6(2) unchanged

Amendment No. 11

Article 7

Amend Article 7 to read as follows:

Quick-frozen foodstuffs intended for retail sale shall be packed by the manufacturer or packer in sealed packages which protect the products from any harmful influence and which must be delivered intact to the consumer.

Quick-frozen foodstuffs intended for retail sale shall be packed by the manufacturer or packer in suitable sealed packages which protect the products from any harmful influence and which must be delivered intact to the consumer.

Article 8(1) unchanged

Amendment No. 12

Article 8(2)

Amend Article 8(2) to read as follows:

The labelling of these foodstuffs must also state the period during which they may be stored in the home of the ultimate consumer, together with the storage temperature or type of storage equipment required.

The labelling of these foodstuffs must also state the period during which they may be stored in the home of the ultimate consumer, together with the storage temperature or type of storage equipment required. This shall be based on the 'stars system' in accordance with CEN standards under which the storage period for each product is equivalent to the date of minimum durability.

Articles 9 to 11 unchanged

Amendment No. 13

Article 12

Amend to read as follows:

1. Where the procedure provided for in this Article is invoked, the matter shall be referred to the Standing Committee for Foodstuffs, hereinafter referred to as the 'Committee', by its Chairman, acting either on his own initiative or at the request of the representative of a Member State.

2. The Commission representative shall submit to the Committee a draft of the measures to be adopted. The Committee shall deliver its opinion on the draft within a period to be determined by the Chairman having regard to the urgency of the matter. It shall decide by a qualified majority, the votes of Member States being weighted as laid down in Article 148(2) of the Treaty. The Chairman shall not vote.

3.(a) The Commission shall adopt the the measures proposed where these are in conformity with the opinion of the Committee.

(b) Where the measures proposed are not in conformity with the opinion of the Committee or where no opinion is delivered, the Commission shall forthwith submit to the Council a proposal concerning the measures to be taken. The Council shall act by a qualified majority.

(c) If, upon the expiry of a period of three months from the date on which the matter is brought before the Council, the latter has failed to act, the proposed measures shall be adopted by the Commission.

1. Where the procedure provided for in this Article is invoked, the matter shall be referred to the European Parliament by the Commission or at the request of the representative of a Member State.

2. The Commission shall submit to Parliament a draft of the measures to be adopted. The European Parliament shall notify the Commission within a period of two months or two part-sessions, depending on which period is longer, whether it intends delivering an opinion on the proposed measures.

3. Where the European Parliament has notified the Commission of its intention of delivering an opinion, shall deliver this opinion within a period of three months of notification; in special cases this period may be extended subject to the approval of the Commission.

4. The Commission shall adopt the measures proposed:

- if the European Parliament has failed to notify the Commission within the time-limit laid down in Paragraph 2 of its intention to deliver an opinion on the proposed measures,

- where the European Parliament after notifying the Commission of its intention of drawing up an opinion, fails to deliver this opinion within the time-limit laid down in Paragraph 3,

or where the measures proposed are
in conformity with the opinion of
the European Parliament,

5. Where the measures proposed are
not in conformity with the opinion of
the European Parliament, the Com-
mission shall forthwith submit to the
Council the proposed measures as
amended by the European Parliament.
The Council shall act by a qualified
majority.

6. If, upon the expiry of a period of
three months from the date on which
the amended proposal is referred to
the Council, the latter has failed to
act, the proposed measures as amended
by the European Parliament shall be
adopted by the Commission.

Amendment No. 14

Article 13

Amend Article 13 to read as follows:

1. The Member States shall take the measures necessary to comply with this Directive. They shall forthwith inform the Commission thereof. Such measures shall be applied in such a way as to:

- permit not later than 1 May 1985 trade in products which comply with this Directive;
- prohibit on 1 May 1986 trade in products which do not comply with this Directive.

2. Notwithstanding paragraph 1, Member States may defer the entry into force of Article 5(2)(b) until 1 January 1995.

1. The Member States shall take the measures necessary to comply with this Directive. They shall forthwith inform the Commission thereof. Such measures shall be applied in such a way as to:

- permit not later than the date on which this Directive is adopted by the Council trade in products which comply with this Directive;
- prohibit on 1 May 1986 trade in products which do not comply with Directive.

2. Notwithstanding paragraph 1, Member States may defer the entry into force of Article 5(2)(b) until 1 January 1992.

Article 14 unchanged

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

closing the procedure for consultation of the European Parliament on the proposal from the Commission of the European Communities to the Council for a directive on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to quick-frozen foodstuffs for human consumption

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the proposal from the Commission to the Council¹,
 - having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EEC Treaty (Doc. /),
 - having regard to the First and Second Programmes of the European Economic Community for a Consumer Protection and Information Policy²,
 - having regard to the opinion of the Economic and Social Committee³,
 - having regard to the demands of consumer organizations and manufacturers,
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the opinion of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food (Doc. A2-53/85),
 - having regard to the result of the vote on the Commission's proposal,
1. Welcomes the proposal because it is likely to increase consumer protection, guarantee the quality of quick-frozen foodstuffs, eliminate existing trade barriers and promote intra-Community trade;
 2. Regrets that the Commission did not include in this proposal a standard sampling procedure and method of analysis; the European Parliament considers that this would have been possible since the Commission's proposal is based on existing proposals in the framework of the Codex Alimentarius;
 3. Would like to see the list of cryogenic fluids announced in Article 4 drawn up forthwith to prevent the introduction of differing national regulations;
 4. Considers it desirable that information and training for distribution and retail trade staff in this field be improved;

¹OJ No. C 267, 6.10.1984 p.6
OJ No. C 317, 28.11.1984, p.9 (correction)

²OJ No. C 92, 25.4.1975, p.1
OJ No. C 133, 3.6.1981, p.1

³ESC 211/85

5. Stresses the need to improve the labelling of quick-frozen foodstuffs introducing a date of minimum durability and providing information for the consumer to ensure that where the low temperature requirements have not been observed, the products in question are not then sold under another designation, for instance, 'frozen' or 'refrigerated';
6. Calls on the Commission to replace the term 'temperature at the centre of the product' by 'temperature of the product' and to permit the fluctuations provided for in Article 5.2 only if short-term fluctuations are involved;
7. Calls on the Commission to follow and promote new technical developments involving, for instance, the use of colours in labelling which change in response to changes in temperature or thermometers which record the temperature over long periods of time, and where possible, to use them in the application of this Directive;
8. Would like to see stricter provisions regarding the implementation of controls included in samples and analysis procedures;
9. Calls on the Commission to amend the provisions regarding the Committee procedure in Article 12 in accordance with the proposals of the European Parliament;
10. Calls on the Commission and Council to accept the proposed amendments;
11. Reserves the right to apply Article 39 of the European Parliament's Rules of Procedure if its proposals are not accepted;
12. Instructs its President to forward to the Council and Commission, as Parliament's opinion, the Commission's proposal as voted by Parliament and the corresponding resolution.



EXPLANATORY STATEMENT1. Contents of the proposal

This proposal seeks to harmonize legislation in Member States covering all the links in the cold chain from manufacturing and distribution to sales to the consumer.

The aim of this is to guarantee the quality of quick-frozen foodstuffs and by clear labelling to promote intra-Community trade. The measures proposed will increase consumer protection since they provide for better information and improved health protection and safety standards.

2. Two important considerations prompted the Commission to submit this proposal for a directive, which has long been demanded by consumer associations.

(a) There has been a sharp increase in the consumption in quick-frozen foodstuffs over the last few years.

In the Federal Republic of Germany, for instance, approximately 683,000 tonnes were sold in 1984 compared with 378,000 tonnes in 1977. This amounts to an 81% increase in volume.

Owing to variations in the legislations of individual Member States there is little intra-Community trade in the products in question; there are even para-tariff trade barriers owing to different national views on the matter. This is contrary to the principles of free trade.

(b) More important than these considerations, however, is the principle of consumer protection.

Quick-freezing is an important modern process to preserve foodstuffs and has many advantages over traditional methods of preservation. This explains the increase in the popularity of these products among consumers.

Certain preconditions must be fulfilled in order to ensure that quick-frozen foodstuffs may be considered healthy and safe; notably certain temperatures must be maintained from the manufacturing to the consumption stage.

The quality of the foodstuffs concerned also depends to a great extent on the manufacturing and processes employed.

The proposal to harmonize EEC legislation on this matter is therefore welcome from every point of view.

3. In practice, however, substantial problems arise.

- (a) There is no agreement among experts as to the temperatures which are necessary to guarantee the safety of these products.

In general terms, it is true to say that the lower the temperature, the better the quality of the products. However, individual foodstuffs react differently, so that the following factors are decisive in determining the quality of quick-frozen foodstuffs: the storage temperature, the storage time and the specific stability of the product concerned.

Products can be divided into three groups:

- products with a low storage sensitivity, including many kinds of fruit and vegetables. These products can be stored at -18°C for between 11 and 15 months.
- products with medium storage sensitivity, including beef and poultry. These products can be stored at -18°C for between 9 and 12 months.
- products with a high storage sensitivity, meat with a high fat content, low-fat fish, mincemeat and many finished products containing fish and meat. These products can be stored at -18°C for between 6 and 9 months.

Lower temperatures - i.e. lower than -18°C - increase the durability of a product while higher temperatures reduce it.

There are conflicting views as to how low temperatures should be to prevent bacteria growth. It is generally agreed that at -18°C no bacteria are present or able to multiply but it is uncertain at what temperatures bacteria activity begins: assessments vary between -18°C and -12°C .

- (b) Initially the quality of quick frozen foodstuffs depends largely on the quick-freezing process employed and the degree of care taken. The European Parliament therefore considers it indispensable that the Commission draw up as soon as possible the list of cryogenic periods announced in Article 4.
- (c) It has been established that after manufacturing, at the wholesale and transport stages products can be kept at -18°C since they are stored in cold storage depots at approximately -30°C and transport in special vehicles guarantees very low temperatures. The only weak link in this chain is the shipment stage. Products may reach slightly higher temperatures at this stage for short periods of time - up to approximately -15°C .
- (d) The situation becomes more complicated when the quick-frozen foodstuffs are offered for sale in retail shops.

Little is known of the period of time quick-frozen products spend in the cold chain. Even less is known about the period of time these products spend in the deep-freezes of consumers themselves. But it is difficult to recommend how long consumers should store these products if the period of previous storage is not precisely known.

In addition there is the problem of open and closed freezers in retail shops.

The retail trade (at least in the Federal Republic of Germany) admits quite openly that the temperatures required by present legislation are not always kept, indeed cannot be kept. Due to the removal of products by consumers, temperatures at the surface may reach -8°C in the evening. This applies both to chest freezers and to upright freezers.

Although at first sight upright freezers seem to be safer, in practice things are different. When the door of an upright freezer opens, the cold air practically falls out, so that the upper drawers are always warmer.

In open chest freezers the temperature is determined on the one hand by the height at which the products are stored - there is a maximum load line - and on the other, by the frequency with which the products in the freezers are moved. Whenever a product is removed - and especially when customers' rummage around' - air currents are produced so that the cold air is lost through the top of the freezer. The products at the top and in the middle of the freezer (furthest away from the walls of the freezer where the cold air emanates from) are most at risk.

In practice, it is generally assumed that the temperature in freezers in the evening is only -08°C .

In operating freezers 'thawing periods' must be observed to prevent the formation of ice. During these thawing periods which occur twice a day, temperatures rise for short periods of time above -18°C .

Furthermore, the outside temperature is a very important factor in maintaining temperatures. When temperatures reach 30°C and above in the summer months in southern countries it is, of course, very much more difficult - and above all more expensive - to achieve extremely low temperatures in deep freezers.

According to the retail trade it requires one-third more energy to go from -12°C to -15°C and three times as much energy to go from -15°C to -18°C . This can be calculated as follows: one hour at -12°C costs DM 1.50, at -15°C DM 2.50, at -18°C DM 4.50. These energy costs, of course, are an important consideration for the retail trade in selling quick-frozen products.

- (e) Throughout the European Community there are manufacturers of deep-freezing equipment who account for a very large share of the market in their respective countries. The manufacturers could easily achieve temperatures substantially lower than -18°C (so that in the thawing and sales periods perhaps -18°C could be maintained).

But this would, of course, entail substantially higher energy costs.

It can be assumed that not all quick-freezing equipment available to the retail trade (and it is this we are talking about) can maintain the legally prescribed temperatures.

More than half this equipment is outdated with an average service life of 10 years.

According to a comparative EEC survey only products of the leading German manufacturer reach the temperatures required in the Commission proposal. This aspect seems particularly important in view of existing legislation in individual Member States.

- (f) Italy at present has the strictest legislation in this matter: it lays down a temperature of -18°C without tolerance.

France and Britain lay down temperatures of -18°C with certain tolerances.

In the Federal Republic of Germany foodstuffs legislation lays down a temperature of -18°C with tolerances of $+6^{\circ}\text{C}$ so that an average temperature of -12°C should be maintained (the retail trade claims that it cannot maintain these temperatures).

Failure to comply with these provisions is an offence in the Federal Republic of Germany. As a result poultry in the Federal Republic is on principle not sold in 'quick-frozen' but only 'frozen' form. This is because it was impossible to guarantee that all quick-frozen poultry could really be maintained at a product temperature of -18°C .

- (g) However, in practice no distinction is made between these two categories since both 'frozen' and 'deep-frozen' products are kept in freezers and are offered for sale in the same manner.

It is therefore important to introduce a more precise labelling system based, for instance, on the 'stars system'.

- (h) It is important to note that the temperature in question is always the product temperature i.e. the temperature in a product - not the surrounding temperature in the freezer - must be at least -18°C . The temperature in the freezer must be considerably lower if the product temperature is to be -18°C . In its proposal the Commission uses the term 'temperature at the centre of the product' without defining what is meant by this. The European Parliament would like this to be replaced by the term 'product temperature' as defined by the Codex-Alimentarius.

In addition, it must be clearly established that only short-term fluctuations of the basic temperature of -18°C are permissible. 'Short-term' covers the shipment process and the period of intensive sales in retail shops. No noticeable changes of quality can be detected in quick-frozen products if the temperature rises by between 3°C and 6°C from periods of between a few hours and three days.

- (i) Today these temperature limits are often exceeded in practice, although this has only had serious consequences on the quick-frozen foodstuffs and the health of consumers in isolated cases.

It should be pointed out in this connection that special offers of quick-frozen food usually involve products which were stored for short periods of time at considerably higher temperatures, i.e. which had begun to thaw and for this reason had to be rapidly sold.

In order to improve consumer protection and information for consumers the European Parliament considers that labelling including a date of minimum durability conservation date is necessary. In fixing the durability date for each product, which should be equivalent to the date of minimum durability, the manufacturer should take into account the maximum permissible higher temperatures over short periods of time.

In order to allow effective controls, standard sampling procedures and methods of analysis procedures must be introduced forthwith on the basis of the regulations already drawn up by the Codex-Alimentarius.

4. The Commission has attempted to base its proposal on the provisions of the Codex-Alimentarius. The Commission's proposals - as amended by the European Parliament - seem to be an adequate approach to the problem.

For the retail trade this means a substantial tightening up of existing legislation in most Member States but guarantees consumer protection and the quality of quick-frozen products even if tolerances regarding temperatures are slightly more generous than in existing legislation in some Member States.

Investigations conducted by the Federal Research Institute for Food Preservation in the Federal Republic of Germany have shown that short-term increases bringing the product temperature up to -12° C (on the retail trade at the selling stage) result in no deterioration of the quality of products and that at temperatures of -12° C it can still be safely assumed that no deterioration occurs as a result of bacterial activity.

In the future stricter controls will have to be introduced in all EEC countries to ensure that temperatures do not rise to an even higher level, as is the case in all Member States today.

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE, FISHERIES AND FOOD

Letter from the Chairman of the Committee to Mrs WEBER, Chairman of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection

Subject: Proposal for a Council Directive on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to quick-frozen foodstuffs for human consumption (COM(84) 489 fin. - Doc. 2-777/84)

Brussels, 20 November 1984

Dear Chairman,

The Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food considered the above proposal from the Commission at its meeting of 20 November 1984.

The objective of the proposed Council Directive is to implement common rules in all Member States for the production, distribution and sale of quick-frozen foodstuffs for the consumer, in order to facilitate the growth of trade within the Community and protect the consumer from unfair commercial transactions by guaranteeing product quality and clear labelling.

Quick-frozen foodstuffs have been growing in importance in many Member States, although the growth of trade has been slow, partly because of lack of common regulations. As a method of preservation, quick-freezing has many advantages over other methods, and it is desirable to encourage the process throughout the Community.

The committee is therefore in favour of the proposal, noting in particular that a transitional period is envisaged before it comes into effect, in order to allow for normal depreciation of existing equipment used for the distribution or retail sale of quick-frozen foodstuffs, so that the industry concerned is not penalized, which would be counter-productive.

Yours sincerely,

(sgd) Teun TOLMAN

The following took part in the vote: Mr Tolman, Chairman; Mr Eyraud, Mr Graefe Zu Baringdorf and Mr Mouchel, Vice-chairmen; Mr Clinton, Mr Dalsass, Mr Ebel (deputizing for Mr Fruh), Mrs Ewing (deputizing for Mr MacSharry), Mr Gatti, Mr Guermeur (deputizing for Mr Fanton), Mrs Jepsen, Mr Klinkenborg (deputizing for Mr Wettig), Mr Maher, Mr Marck, Mrs S. Martin, Mr Newens (deputizing for Mrs Castle), Mr F. Pisoni, Mr Raftery (deputizing for Mr Mertens), Mr Remacle (deputizing for Mr Vernimmen), Mr Simmonds, Mr Spath (deputizing for Mr Bocklett) and Mr Stavrou.